NCHS – Practice Paper

SECTION A (Source-Based Case Study)

Question 1 is **compulsory** for all candidates.

Living in a Diverse Society

Study the Background Information and the sources carefully, and then answer the question.

You may use any of the sources to help you answer the question, in addition to the source you are told to use. In answering the question, you should use your knowledge of the topic to help you interpret and evaluate the sources.

1 Study Source A.

How reliable is Source A as evidence about the benefits of HDB's Ethnic Integration Policy? Explain your answer.

[7]

Is the Ethnic Integration Policy still relevant in Singapore?

BACKGROUND INFORMATION

Read this carefully. It may help you to answer some of the questions.

The Ethnic Integration Policy (EIP) was introduced in 1989 to ensure a balanced mix of ethnic groups in HDB estates, and to prevent the formation of racial enclaves. It seeks to promote racial integration in Singapore by allowing residents of different ethnicities to live together and interact on a regular basis in public housing, where 80% of the population lives. The EIP is implemented for all ethnic groups. Under the EIP, there are limits on the total percentage of a block or neighbourhood that may be occupied by a certain ethnicity. However, some have criticized that the EIP is irrelevant as it does not really promote integration among ethnic groups. Hence, is the Ethnic Integration Policy still relevant in today's context?

Source A An interview in 2015 where Senior Minister Tharman Shanmugaratnam spoke about the Ethnic Integration Policy.

When the Ethnic Integration Policy was first introduced in 1989, I don't think we knew how important it was going to be. Once people of different ethnic groups live together, they are not just walking the corridors and going to the same primary school, because all over the world young kids go to school very near to where they live and they grow up together. The EIP has helped to maintain racial and social harmony in Singapore by providing opportunities for social mixing among Singaporeans of different races. Nonetheless, I have to admit that the EIP is definitely one of the most intrusive* social policy in Singapore.

*intrusive - causing disruption or annoyance through being unwelcome or uninvited

Source B A comment from a Singaporean living in a HDB apartment about the Ethnic Integration Policy

The Ethnic Integration Policy works on the assumption that by living in close quarters, residents of different ethnicities will be forced to mingle and interact with each other, thereby strengthening the racial harmony and unity in Singapore. However, does living together equal, or necessarily lead to, integration and understanding? In my opinion, Singaporeans, by and large, tend not to mix around or even acknowledge their neighbours, which means the core function of the EIP may not always be the only tool that works. Just look at the recent gong incident, in which a Chinese woman started hitting a gong while her Indian neighbor was carrying out a prayer ritual. Certainly, some of these cases have shown that proximity does not necessarily breed understanding.

Source C A comment from Minister of National Development, Desmond Lee, about the relevance of Ethnic Integration Policy (EIP) during parliamentary discussion in 2020

A mayor of a big city that has suffered from serious racial segregation and conflict came up to me. He said to me that he wished his city had implemented a version of the EIP much earlier on to foster harmony and avert the unrest that they now regularly face. But now that societal divisions have hardened along racial and ethnic lines in his city, it is not a feasible nor politically attainable option to implement a similar policy. That is how bad the situation had become and that conversation with this mayor stuck in my mind all these years, reminding me of the importance in the continuation of EIP in Singapore.

SECTION B (Structured Response Question)

Question 2 is **compulsory** for all candidates

1 Exploring Citizenship and Governance.

Study the extracts carefully, and then answer the questions.

Extract 1

It has been reported in a new study that elderly folk living with their families may be surrounded by people but they can still feel socially isolated. More than half of those who felt socially disconnected said they do not have someone they can go to for help. Social disconnection refers to the lack of social, emotional and physical engagement with other people, and is strongly linked to social isolation and loneliness.

A professor who co-led the study said that it is a reminder that social disconnection could become a bigger issue in the near future, given Singapore's ageing population and with more elderly people living alone.

2. **Extract 1** illustrates how elderlies can experience social disconnection in Singapore.

In your opinion, how can we address this issue of social disconnection that the elderly is facing in Singapore? Explain your answer with **two** suggestions.

[7]

Copyright acknowledgement

Source A: https://www.gov.sg/article/hdbs-ethnic-integration-policy-why-it-still-matters

Source B: Ibid.

Source C: https://www.mnd.gov.sg/newsroom/parliament-matters/q-as/view/oral-answer-by-ministry-of-

national-development-on-the-ethnic-integration-policy

Secondary 3 Social Studies Practice Paper Suggested LORMS

1 Study Source A.

How reliable is Source A as evidence about the benefits of HDB's Ethnic Integration Policy? Explain your answer. [7]

Marker's Report

- Most students were able to achieve L3/4 minimally as they were able to CR to another source with matching claims.
- A handful of students gave superficial claims without inferring about its effectiveness/benefits as a whole (eg. EIP allows more people to live and interact with one another)

Level /Mark	Descriptor
L1 / 1-2	Reliability based on superficial assessment of content and lifting of content from source
	e.g. Yes, it is reliable in showing that the Ethnic Integration Policy helped to maintain racial and social harmony in Singapore as there will be more opportunities for interaction between ethnic groups.
	e.g. No, it is not reliable as it is simply a comment made by Senior Minister Tharman who did not show any statistics or evidence showing whether the Ethnic Integration Policy was still relevant in today's context.
L2 / 2-3	Reliability based on content OR Sub-message or superficial claims, cross-referenced (L2/3) ➤ Making inference → Candidates infer that the EIP is a success or is still relevant in integrating the society L2/2m with cross reference, L3/4m ➤ Making inference – explaining that the EIP is effective/ has improved in maintaining a harmonious society in Singapore L2/3 with cross reference, L3/5m ➤ Sub-Message with cross reference (L2/3m)
	Award the higher mark for answers supporting evidence. E.g. Source A is reliable as evidence about the benefits of HDB's Ethnic Integration Policy as it claims that the policy benefitted in creating a harmonious society in Singapore. This is seen from "Once people of different ethnic groups live together, they are not just walking the corridors and taking the same primary school The EIP has helped to maintain racial and social

harmony in Singapore by providing opportunities for social mixing among Singaporeans of different races." Hence, the source suggests that the Ethnic Integration Policy is important to an ethnically-diverse society in Singapore. Despite its challenges in implementing the policy, Senior Minister Tharman believes that the policy brings much benefits to the people in Singapore.

L3 / 4-5 L2 + Reliability based on cross-reference to other sources

Award the higher mark for cross-references to both sides, <u>or</u> 1 well developed cross-reference, <u>cross reference must match</u>.

Reliable (Cross-reference to Source C)

E.g. Source A is reliable as evidence about the benefits of HDB's Ethnic Integration Policy as it claims that the policy benefitted in creating a harmonious society in Singapore. This is seen from "Once people of different ethnic groups live together, they are not just walking the corridors and taking the same primary school.. The EIP has helped to maintain racial and social harmony in Singapore by providing opportunities for social mixing among Singaporeans of different races." Hence, the source suggests that the Ethnic Integration Policy is important to an ethnically-diverse society in Singapore. Despite its challenges in implementing the policy, Senior Minister Tharman believes that the policy brings much benefits to the people in Singapore. Cross referencing to Source C, it supports Source A in showing the importance of Ethnic Integration Policy in maintaining a harmonious society in Singapore. Source C shows that a mayor of a big city wished his city had implemented a version of the EIP and how this conversation reminded Minister Desmond Lee of the importance in the continuation of EIP in Singapore which created a harmonious society here. As Source C supports Source A, it shows that Source A is a reliable source showing the benefits HDB's ethnic integration policy.

AND/OR

<u>Unreliable (Cross-reference to Sources B)</u>

E.a.

Source A is unreliable as evidence about the benefits of HDB's Ethnic Integration Policy as it claims that the policy is beneficial in creating a harmonious society in Singapore. This is seen from "Once people of different ethnic groups live together, they are not just walking the corridors and taking the same primary school.. The EIP has helped to maintain racial and social harmony in Singapore by providing opportunities for social mixing among Singaporeans of different races." Hence, it suggests that the Ethnic Integration Policy is important to an ethnically-diverse society in Singapore. However, the implementation of a policy does not necessarily guarantee the desired outcome of the policy. Source B challenges Source A by stating that

"The Ethnic Integration Policy works on the assumption that by living in close quarters, residents of different ethnicities will be forced to mingle and interact with each other... Certainly, some of these cases (the gong incident) have shown that proximity does not necessarily breed understanding." This explains that the EIP is not an effective policy in integrating the various ethnic groups in Singapore. Hence, Source A is unreliable as it does not consider the effectiveness of the Ethnic Integration policy.

L4 / 6-7 L2 + Reliability based on evaluation of provenance, purpose and context

L4/6 for:

- L2 + strong analysis (all elements present writer's intent, message, outcome)
- L3 + developed analysis but with one aspect (context/message/outcome) missing

L4/7: MUST be L3 (CR) + writer's intent, message, outcome and context.

Reliable

Source A is reliable as evidence about the benefits of HDB's ethnic integration policy because of its provenance/purpose. From the interview, we can see that Senior Minister Tharman Shanmugaratnam understood the challenges of integrating the different ethnic groups in Singapore and felt that it was important for the government to continue to implement the policy to create space and opportunities for people of different ethnicities to interact and understand better. In this interview, SM Tharman seeks to clarify/convince Singaporeans that the Ethnic Integration policy is essential in creating a harmonious society in Singapore. Calling it the "most intrusive social policy in Singapore", he also understood the skepticism of such policy that bind people of different ethnicities together. Addressing the issue of Ethnic Integration Policy, he hopes that the general public would understand from the government's perspective of implementing such policy and the challenges of managing a diverse society in Singapore and to continue to support the government in the continuation of the EIP. Given that the source acknowledges the trade-offs, it is also fairly balanced and hence reliable.

Or – unreliable

Source A is unreliable as evidence about the benefits of HDB's ethnic integration policy due to its purpose. As the Senior Minister, Mr. Tharman

wanted to **convince Singaporeans** that EIP has benefitted in creating a harmonious society. Source A shows that "The EIP has helped to maintain racial and social harmony in Singapore by providing opportunities for social mixing among Singaporeans of different races." By addressing the issue of Ethnic Integration Policy during an interview, SM Tharman **hopes that** the general public would continue to support the government in the continuation of the EIP. Also, source A is unreliable as living in proximity does not necessarily lead to more interaction among races.

(Based on my knowledge, the government has been trying to build strong kampong spirits among people living in HDB and to continue to build a good relationship with their neighbours, regardless of race or religion. However, whatever desired outcome that the policy wishes to achieve, we should be realistic that living in proximity does not necessarily lead to more interaction.)

6. Extract 1 illustrates how elderlies can experience social disconnection in Singapore.

In your opinion, how can we address this issue of social disconnection that the elderly is facing in Singapore [7]

Skill: Explaining strategies

L1/1 Describes the topic without addressing the question

L2/2-

Identifies/Describes strategies / Explain strategies without description

- Award 2 marks for identifying 1 strategy
- Award 3 marks for describing 1 strategy
- Award 4 marks for describing 2 strategies

L3/5-

Explain the strategies

- Award 5-6 marks for explaining one strategy in detail
- Award 6-7 marks for explaining two strategies in detail

E.g. We can ensure the elderly stay socially connected by forming a voluntary group from ground-up to interact with them on a more frequent basis. This can be done especially in the more mature housing estates where the elderly tend to be staying in. Also these voluntary groups should be visiting these elderly on a more frequent basis to build stronger bonds with them and they should be able to speak dialects to interact more smoothly with the elderly. For instance, the Lion Befrienders Service Association organizes visits to engage elderly with exercise and handicraft to help them stay active. These voluntary groups should also ensure that there is sustainability in their activities so that there is continuity in their plan. Besides interacting with them, these voluntary groups can also teach the elderly new skills to stimulate their minds. With this engagement by voluntary groups, it ensures that the elderly always have a person to talk to on a regular basis. This helps them to feel less lonely and feel supported by the people around them.

E.g. We should also educate the young about the importance and ways they can interact with the elderly at home. This can be done during CCE lessons or it can also be part of the Service-Learning project which the students embark on so that they can have a hands-on experience with the elderly. During the CCE lessons, basic dialect and also common topics to talk to elderly about can be shared so that the young can help in engaging the elderly at home. Furthermore, organisations like National Heritage Board has also a Pen Pal Corner programme to provide topics like 'Past times' and 'Housing' in the past and present for children to start conversation with the elderly. Through this way, in the long run, the youths will not lose their communicative skills with the older generation and also change their mind-set about the difficulties of communicating with the elderly. They can also play a part by striking up a conversation with the elderly at home. This helps elderly to feel more connected and heard by the younger generation, gaining greater confidence to communicate with others.